

# 2010 Annual Report of ATV-Related Deaths and Injuries

December 2011

Sarah Garland, Ph.D. Directorate for Epidemiology Division of Hazard Analysis U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission 4330 East West Highway Bethesda, MD 20814

CPSA 5(b)(1) CLEARED for PUBLIC PRODUCTS IDENTIFIED \_\_\_\_EXCEPTED BY: PETITION RULEMAKING ADMIN. PRCDG \_\_\_WITH PORTIONS REMOVED: \_\_\_

This analysis was prepared by CPSC staff. It has not been reviewed or approved by, and may not necessarily reflect the views of, the Commission. CPSC Hotline: I-800-638-CPSC (2772) \$\$ CPSC's Web Site: http://www.cpsc.gov

### **Executive Summary**

#### ATV-related Fatalities

- As of December 31, 2010, CSPC staff received reports of 11,001 ATV-related fatalities occurring between 1982 and 2010. CPSC staff has received reports of 317 ATV-related fatalities occurring in 2010, 649 occurring in 2009, 707 occurring in 2008, and 804 occurring in 2007. Reporting for the years 2007 through 2010 is ongoing; these numbers are expected to increase in future reports.
- From 1982 through 2010, CPSC staff received reports of 2,775 ATV-related fatalities that were children younger than 16 years of age. This represents 25 percent of the total number of reported ATV-related fatalities (11,001).
- Of the 2,775 ATV-related fatalities of children younger than 16 years of age, 1,184 (43 percent) were younger than 12 years of age.
- In 2006, the most recent year where reporting is considered complete, 142 (17 percent) of the reported 833 ATV-related fatalities were children younger than 16 years of age.
- The estimated number of ATV-related fatalities is 781 for 2009, 833 for 2008, and 893 for 2007. Reporting for 2007 through 2009 is ongoing; thus, these numbers are expected to change in future reports.
- In 2006, the most recent year where reporting is considered complete, the estimated number of ATV-related fatalities is 903. The estimated number of 4-wheel ATV-related fatalities in 2006 is 876. The corresponding estimated risk of death per 10,000 4-wheel ATVs in use is 1.0 for the year 2006, decreasing from 1.1 in 2005.

#### ATV-related Emergency Department-Treated Injury Estimates

- In 2010, there is an estimated 115,000 ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries in the United States. An estimated 28,300 (25 percent) of these were children younger than 16 years of age.
- The decrease in the estimated number of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries from 2009 to 2010 (131,900 in 2009 to 115,000 in 2010) is a statistically significant decrease.
- The increasing trend in the number of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries from 2001 to 2010 is statistically significant.
- From 2009 to 2010, the 12.7 percent decrease in the estimated number of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries for children younger than 16 years of age (32,400 in 2009 to 28,300 in 2010) is not statistically significant.
- No trend is detected in the estimated number of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries for children younger than 16 years of age from 2001 to 2010.
- Children younger than 12 years of age represent 14,100 of the ATV-related emergency departmenttreated injuries in 2010, which constitutes 12 percent of the total number of estimated injuries.

# **Table of Contents**

Executive Summary	2
Introduction	4
Background	4
ATV-Related Fatalities	4
Reported Deaths	5
Reported Deaths by State	6
Reported Deaths of Children	8
Three-Wheel Versus Four-Wheel ATVs	10
Estimated ATV-Related Deaths and Risk of Death, 1985 to 2009	10
ATV-Related Injuries	13
ATVs with 3, 4, and Unknown Number of Wheels	13
Four-Wwheel ATVs	16
Discussion	17
1982–1998	17
1999–2006	
2007–2010	18
Appendix A: Estimation Methodologies	20
ATV-Related Deaths	20
In-Scope ATV-Related Fatalities	20
ICD-9 Versus ICD-10 Coding	20
Estimation of ATV-Related Fatalities (1999–Present)	20
Estimation of ATV-Related Fatalities (1985–1998)	21
Estimation of Fatalities Associated with Four-Wheel ATVs	22
Risk of Death Per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use	22
Estimation of ATV-Related Injuries	23
Coefficients of Variation	23
Estimation of Hospital Emergency Department-Treated Injuries Associated with Four-Wheel ATVs	23
Risk of Injury Per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use	24
Changes in Injury Estimates and Risk of Injury Per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use	24
Appendix B: Historical Estimated Number of Emergency Department-Treated Injuries 1985–2010	25
References	26

# List of Tables

Table 1: Reported Fatalities by Year 1982–2010	5
Table 2: Reported Fatalities by State 1982–2010	7
Table 3: Reported ATV-Related Fatalities for Children Younger than 16 and 12 Years of Age 1982-2010	9
Table 4: Annual Estimated ATV-Related Fatalities and Risk of Death per 10,000 ATVs in Use	. 12
Table 5: Annual Estimates of ATV-Related Emergency Department-Treated Injuries 2001–2010	. 13
Table 6: Estimated Number of Emergency Department-Treated Injuries by Age Group 2001–2010	. 14
Table 7: Estimated Number of Emergency Department-Treated Injuries and Risk of Emergency Department-	
Treated Injury per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use 2001–2010	. 16
Table 8: Historical ATV-Related Emergency Department-Treated Injuries Estimates for ATVs with 3,4, or	
Unknown Number of Wheels and Four-Wheel ATVs from 1985 to 2010	.25

# List of Figures

Figure 1: Number of Reported ATV-Related Fatalities by State (1982–2006)	8
Figure 2: Reported ATV-Related Fatalities by Age Group (2001–2006)	. 10
Figure 3: Annual ATV-Related Hospital Emergency Department-Treated Injury Estimates by Age Group	
(2001–2010)	15

## Introduction

This report presents the 2010 annual update of information collected by U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission (CPSC) staff on deaths and injuries related to the use of all-terrain vehicles (ATVs). The update includes information on ATV-related deaths based on data available to CPSC staff as of December 31, 2010, as well as information on ATV-related injuries treated in hospital emergency departments from January 1, 2010, through December 31, 2010.

The report begins with a brief background section. This is followed by a summary of ATV-related fatality <u>counts</u> (reports) derived from CPSC staff data and a discussion of reported ATV-related deaths involving children younger than 12 and 16 years of age. Then, based on the counts of ATV-related fatalities reported to CPSC staff, annual <u>estimates</u> of ATV-related deaths are presented, together with estimates of the annual risk of death per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use. Next, the report provides estimates of ATV-related hospital emergency department-treated injuries, along with estimates of the annual risk of injury per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use. The report concludes with a short discussion of the observed patterns of ATV-related deaths and injuries over time.

## Background

CPSC staff considers an ATV to be an off-road, motorized vehicle having three or four low-pressure tires, a straddle seat for the operator, and handlebars for steering control. Off-road motor vehicles having steering wheels and either bench or bucket seats (*e.g.*, golf carts, dune buggies, recreational off-highway vehicles (ROVs), and certain types of utility vehicles), are not categorized as ATVs by CPSC staff. Consequently, fatalities and injuries associated with these types of vehicles are not addressed in this report.

CPSC staff first began analyzing ATV-related incident data in the early 1980s, in order to provide information on the numbers of deaths and injuries associated with three-wheel ATVs. In the late 1980s, the major ATV distributors agreed to stop the distribution of three-wheel ATVs (U.S. CPSC, 2006). Consequently, although some older three-wheel ATVs continue to be used by consumers, nearly all ATVs in use today are four-wheel ATVs. In 2005, the CPSC issued an advance notice of proposed rulemaking followed by a notice of proposed rulemaking in 2006, for ATVs. Section 232 of the CPSC to make the voluntary standard a mandatory standard and complete its rulemaking process for ATVs. The mandatory standard was published in late 2008, and it became effective in April 2009. The CPSIA also imposed certain additional requirements on ATVs through ATV action plans, and it prohibited the importation and distribution of three-wheel ATVs.

## **ATV-Related Fatalities**

This section provides details on the numbers of ATV-related death reports received by CPSC staff on or before December 31, 2010, and it discusses the estimates associated with ATV-related deaths. The reported numbers of deaths are totaled in Table 1, listed by state in Table 2, and categorized by age group in Table 3. The estimated numbers of deaths associated with ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels are reported in Table 4, with the estimated numbers of four-wheel ATV-related fatalities, the estimated number of four-wheel ATVs in use, and the estimated risk of death per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use. Discussions of the results presented in these tables are provided in this section, in the discussion section, and in the attached appendices.

#### **Reported Deaths**

By December 31, 2010, CPSC staff had received reports of 11,001 ATV-related deaths that occurred between 1982 and 2010 (Table 1). The number of fatality reports increased by 720 since the December 31, 2009, tabulation prepared by CPSC staff (U.S. CPSC, December 2010). Since the end of the previous reporting period, 56 death records were identified to have the incorrect date of death stored in CPSC's All-Terrain Vehicle Deaths (ATVD) database. The numbers of reported deaths in Table 1 reflect the updates of these records.

Year <sup>1</sup>	Reported Number of Deaths	Difference Since Last Update* (12/31/2009)
Total	11,001	+720
2010	317	+317
2009	649	+273
2008	707	+91
2007	804	+38
2006	833	0
2005	799	-5
2004	754	+3
2003	653	0
2002	550	+2
2001	520	+3
2000	447	-3
1999	397	0
1998	252	+1
1997	240	-1
1996	249	+1
1995	200	0
1994	198	0
1993	183	0
1992	220	-1
1991	230	0
1990	235	+1
1989	230	0
1988	250	0
1987	264	0
1986	300	+1
1985	250	-1
1984	156	0
1983	85	0
1982	29	0

	Table 1	
Report	ed ATV-Related Fa	talities (by Year)
ATVs with	n 3, 4, or Unknown	Number of Wheels
eported for the Per	iod January 1, 198	2 through December 31, 2010
	Reported	Difference Since Last

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis.

\*Note: Since the end of the previous reporting period, 56 death records in the ATVD database were updated to reflect the correct date of death for the victim. As such, the number of reported deaths has changed in several years, as reflected in Table 1.

\* The dotted line denotes the years were reporting is ongoing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Italics indicate that reporting is ongoing for the years 2007–2010.

Data collection for the years 2007 through 2010 is ongoing. As a result, the numbers of reported deaths for 2007 through 2010 are expected to increase before the next annual report is prepared.

In Table 1, the counts presented for 1999 and later (*i.e.*, the values above the heavy line) reflect a revised mortality data classification system from the system used prior to 1999. Specifically, the heavy line marks the change from death certificate mortality coding under the Ninth Revision of the International Classification of Diseases (ICD-9) to coding under the Tenth Revision (ICD-10), a transition that allows CPSC staff to gather more accurate mortality data for a number of consumer products, including ATVs. This change was implemented by the National Center for Health Statistics (NCHS) in January 1999 (NCHS, 2007). Since the implementation of ICD-10 coding, all ATV-related fatalities, including incidents involving traffic accidents on public roads, are grouped under a single set of mortality codes. Because of the use of different coding systems between the two periods (*i.e.*, prior to 1999, versus 1999 and later), comparisons of numbers between these periods should be undertaken with caution. The ICD-10 transition and related methodological issues are discussed more fully in Appendix A.

#### Reported Deaths by State

Table 2 gives the numbers of reported ATV-related deaths for each state, the District of Columbia, and Puerto Rico. States are listed in descending order of the number of ATV-related fatalities reported for the years 1982 through 2006 (*i.e.*, the years for which data collection is considered complete). Reported deaths that occurred during these years are tabulated in the second column. The following states had the highest numbers of ATV-related deaths occurring in this period: California (467), Pennsylvania (424), Texas (424), West Virginia (398), and Kentucky (377). Together, these five states accounted for 25 percent of all reported ATV-related deaths in the United States for the years 1982 through 2006 (n = 8,523), as shown in the third column of Table 2.

When reviewing state death counts for the period 1982 through 2006, two points deserve note:

- Consistent with CPSC staff's previous annual reports on ATV-related deaths and injuries, the counts shown in Table 2 have not been adjusted for demographic characteristics (*e.g.*, total population, age structure of population).
- Also consistent with previous CPSC staff reports, these counts reflect the state in which the death occurred, rather than the state where the ATV incident occurred. This approach allows the most accurate matching of death certificates to other types of incident reports received by CPSC staff. As medical transport capabilities (e.g., helicopter transport) and trauma care have advanced in recent years, some states with major trauma centers have ATV-related fatalities included in their reported counts for incidents that did not occur within their state boundaries. Similarly, some states have reported counts that do not fully capture all of the ATV-related fatality incidents that occurred within their state boundaries.

The fourth column of Table 2 presents, by state, the number of ATV-related deaths reported to CPSC staff as of December 31, 2010, for the period 2007 through 2010. These counts should not be used for comparisons between states because data collection for this period is ongoing and because data collection for some states is more complete than for other states for these years.

Each state's total number of reported deaths since 1982 is listed in the fifth column. These counts include information for the years that have ongoing reporting, as well as information for the years where data collection is considered complete.

Table 2
Reported ATV-Related Fatalities (by State)
ATVs with 3, 4, or Unknown Number of Wheels
Reported for the Period January 1, 1982 through December 31, 2010

State	Reported Deaths 1982–2006	Cumulative Percent of U.S. 1982–2006	Reported Deaths (Ongoing Reporting) 2007–2010*	Total Reported Deaths* (Ongoing Reporting)
CALIFORNIA	467	5%	121	588
PENNSYLVANIA	424	10%	97	521
TEXAS	424	15%	141	565
WEST VIRGINIA	398	20%	148	546
KENTUCKY	377	25%	122	499
FLORIDA	361	29%	104	465
TENNESSEE	331	33%	101	432
NEW YORK	314	36%	63	377
NORTH CAROLINA	302	40%	91	393
MICHIGAN	294	43%	62	356
GEORGIA	279	47%	.36	315
MISSISSIPPI	260	50%	62	.322
OHIO	255	53%	81	336
MISSOURI	241	55%	85	326
ARKANSAS	236	58%	67	303
MINNESOTA	200	61%	48	270
WISCONSIN	218	63%	63	281
ALABAMA	101	66%	73	264
I OUISIANA	101	68%	55	246
ARIZONA	184	70%	59	243
	181	70%	63	240
INDIANA	156	72%	48	214 204
VIRGINIA	156	76%		207
UTAH	146	78%	43	189
OREGON	140	70%	40	180
ALASKA	131	81%	25	156
OKLAHOMA	120	82%	50	170
COLORADO	123	84%	41	152
IOWA	108	85%	26	134
MAINE	100	86%	23	130
IDAHO	107	87%	52	157
KANSAS	105	80%	20	13/
SOUTH CAROLINA	90	90%	38	137
WASHINGTON	98	91%	30	137
NEW MEXICO	86	97%	8	0/
NERRASKA	78	03%	20	107
NEVADA	70	93%	18	80
MASSACHUSETTS	65	94%	10	69
NEWJERSEY	63	95%	11	74
MONTANA	60	96%	20	80
MARYLAND	58	96%	23	79
NEW HAMPSHIRE	54	97%	0	63
NORTH DAKOTA	50	98%	20	70
SOUTH DAKOTA	49	98%	16	65
VERMONT	48	90%	16	64
CONNECTICUT	35	99%	6	41
WYOMING	34	100%	21	55
HAWAII	13	100%	2	16
DELAWARE	7	100%	3	10
RHODE ISLAND	6	100%	2	8
WASHINGTON D.C.	4	100%	1	5
PUERTO RICO	2	100%	0	2

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis. Note: State rankings are based on ATV-related fatality counts for the period 1982–2006. \*Italicized data (columns 4 and 5) denote the years for which reporting is ongoing (2007–2010).

Figure 1 represents the first two columns of Table 2. The intensity of the color in each state represents the number of reported ATV-related fatalities from 1982 through 2006.





Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis. Graph generated using JMP9®. Note: This figure corresponds to the first two columns of Table 2. Reporting for 2007–2010 is ongoing; thus, Figure 1 does not display these years.

#### Reported Deaths of Children

A review of the reported ATV-related fatalities indicates that 2,775 decedents (25 percent of the 11,001 total) between 1982 and 2010 were younger than 16 years of age, and 1,184 (11 percent of the total reported number of fatalities) were younger than 12 years of age. Forty-three percent of ATV-related child fatalities (that is, children under 16 years of age) were children younger than 12 years of age. Table 3 gives the total number of reported fatalities by year, for individuals younger than 16 years of age; the corresponding percentage to the total number of reported fatalities by year; the total numbers of fatalities by year for children younger than 12 years of age; and the corresponding percentage relating to all fatalities of children younger than 12 years of age. Figure 2 displays the total number of reported fatalities by year and age group from 2001 to 2006.

Year <sup>2</sup>	Younger Than 16	Younger Than 16: Percent of Total	Younger Than 12	Younger Than 12: Percent of Children*
Total	2,775	25%	1,184	43%
2010	55	17%	26	47%
2009	93	14%	39	42%
2008	105	15%	50	48%
2007	132	16%	56	42%
2006	142	17%	63	44%
2005	162	20%	77	48%
2004	182	24%	70	38%
2003	153	23%	69	45%
2002	133	24%	45	34%
2001	133	26%	58	44%
2000	123	28%	50	41%
1999 <sup>3</sup>	90	23%	34	38%
1998	82	33%	30	37%
1997	79	33%	38	48%
1996	87	35%	40	46%
1995	64	32%	26	41%
1994	54	27%	20	37%
1993	59	32%	18	31%
1992	71	32%	32	45%
1991	68	30%	40	59%
1990	81	34%	27	33%
1982–1989	627	40%	276	44%

Table 3Reported ATV-Related Fatalities for Children Younger than 16 and 12 Years of AgeATVs with 3, 4, or Unknown Number of WheelsReported for the Period January 1, 1982 through December 31, 2010

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis. Note: Italics denote the period for which reporting is ongoing.

\*Percent of children younger than 16 years of age.

While the percentage of victims younger than 16 years of age appears to have declined since 1998, it is also probable that adult deaths were underreported during the period 1982 to 1998. Because of coding limitations for ATV-related fatalities under the old ICD-9 system (see Appendix A), CPSC staff generally was not able to gather reports of deaths on public roads during those years. If adults were more likely than children to have been involved in ATV-related fatality incidents on public roads, then the calculated percentages of deaths involving children, shown in Table 3, may be higher than the true proportion of ATV-related fatalities involving children for the years prior to 1999.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Reporting is ongoing for 2007–2010. Percentages for these years should be interpreted with caution because the rate at which deaths are reported may not be consistent across all age groups.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Beginning in 1999, death certificates were coded under the Tenth Revision of the International Classification of Diseases (ICD-10). See Appendix A for an explanation of the effect of this change.



### Figure 2: Reported ATV-Related Fatalities by Age Group (2001–2006)

Less than 12
Age 12-15
Age 16+

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis. Note: This figure corresponds to the data reported in Tables 1 and 3. Reporting for 2007–2010 is ongoing; thus, Figure 2 does not display these years.

#### Three-Wheel Versus Four-Wheel ATVs

As noted in the background section, CPSC staff began tabulating reports of ATV-related deaths and injuries in the early 1980s in order to assess incidents associated with three-wheel ATVs. However, in the late1980s, the major distributors agreed to stop the distribution of three-wheel ATVs; and currently, the ATVs distributed in the United States are nearly all four-wheel models (U.S. CPSC, 2006). The percentage of reported fatalities involving four-wheel ATVs increased from 7 percent or less, prior to 1985, to more than 95 percent in 2010, based on 2010 fatalities reported to CPSC staff as of December 31, 2010. Although data collection for 2010 is ongoing, this percentage is not expected to change greatly as additional reports of 2010 fatalities are received.

From the incident reports, it is not always possible to ascertain whether the ATV involved in the incident has three wheels or four wheels. In these cases, the vehicle is coded as an ATV having an unknown number of wheels. For the estimates of ATV-related deaths described below, ATVs having an unknown number of wheels were apportioned between three-wheel and four-wheel ATVs, using the methods described in Appendix A.

#### Estimated ATV-Related Deaths and Risk of Death, 1985 to 2009

Death reports received by CPSC staff represent a minimum count of ATV-related deaths because not all ATV-related fatalities may be reported. To account for unreported deaths, CPSC staff estimated annual ATV-related fatalities for the period 1985 to 2009, using a statistical estimation method (Hook

and Regal, 2004). See Appendix A for details on this estimation method. Table 4 shows both the annual reported <u>counts</u> and the <u>estimated number</u> of ATV-related deaths involving ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels. Table 4 also presents the annual estimated risk of death per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use for this period. Due to the low data collection completion rate as of December 31, 2010, estimates for 2010 were not calculated for this report but will be estimated in future reports.

Again, the heavy line between 1998 and 1999 in Table 4 demarcates the switch from mortality data collection under ICD-9, to collection under ICD-10. Because mortality coding under ICD-10 allows CPSC staff to gather more complete data on ATV-related deaths, some of the increase in estimated deaths observed between 1998 and 1999 is probably a result of the ICD-9 to ICD-10 transition. Although the magnitude of the effect of the coding change is unknown, it follows that the death estimates and risks calculated for the years prior to 1999 may have been underestimated.

Column 5 of Table 4 gives annual estimates of the number of four-wheel ATVs in use. According to CPSC staff's *All Terrain Vehicle 2001 Injury and Exposure Studies*, in 2001, about 5.6 million threeand four-wheel ATVs were in use, and about 86 percent of these were four-wheel ATVs (Levenson, 2003a). Since that study, CPSC staff has relied on annual ATV sales information, together with survival analysis models, to derive estimates of the number of four-wheel ATVs in use each year.

A discussion of the methodologies used to estimate ATV-related deaths and the risk of death per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use is given in Appendix A.

Based on Fatality Data Available as of December 31, 2010							
Year <sup>4</sup>	Reported Deaths	Estimated Deaths Associated with ATVs with 3, 4, or Unknown Wheels	Estimated Deaths Involving 4- Wheel ATVs	Estimated 4- Wheel ATVs in Use (millions) <sup>5</sup>	Estimated Risk of Death per 10,000 4-Wheel ATVs in Use		
2009	649	781	762	10.5	0.7		
2008	707	833	813	10.2	0.8		
2007	804	893	864	9.5	0.9		
2006	833	903	876	8.6	1.0		
2005	799	924	883	7.8	1.1		
2004	754	854	815	7.0	1.2		
2003	653	762	726	6.3	1.2		
2002	550	609	571	5.6	1.0		
2001	520	598	553	4.9	1.1		
2000	447	547	498	4.2	1.2		
1999 <sup>6</sup>	397	534	485	3.6	1.4		
1998	252	289	247	3.1	0.8		
1997	240	290	236	2.7	0.9		
1996	249	268	209	2.4	0.9		
1995	200	273	210	2.2	1.0		
1994	198	243	168	2.0	0.8		
1993	183	210	143	1.9	0.7		
1992	220	242	159	1.9	0.8		
1991	230	254	151	1.8	0.8		
1990	235	252	152	1.8	0.9		
1989	230	257	152	1.6	0.9		
1988	250	285	151	1.4	1.1		
1987	264	282	126	1.1	1.1		
1986	300	348	95	0.7	1.3		
1985	250	293	55	0.4	1.5		

Table 4 Annual Estimates of ATV-Related Fatalities and Risk of Death per 10,000 4-Wheel ATVs in Use 1985-2009

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Directorate for Economic Analysis and Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis.

Note: Italics denote the period for which reporting is ongoing. Note: The number of reported deaths has changed in several years (see note for Table 1). This affects the estimated deaths; thus, the estimated deaths in historic years show different estimates than previously reported.

<sup>5</sup> Estimates have been rounded.

<sup>6</sup> Beginning in 1999, death certificates were coded under the Tenth Revision of the International Classification of Diseases (ICD-10). See Appendix A for an explanation of the effect of this change.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Reporting is ongoing for 2007–2009.

## **ATV-Related Injuries**

#### ATVs with Three, Four, and Unknown Numbers of Wheels

Table 5 shows estimates of ATV-related injuries treated in hospital emergency departments nationwide between January 1, 2001, and December 31, 2010. These estimates were generated based on the CPSC's National Electronic Injury Surveillance System (NEISS), a probability sample of U.S. hospitals with 24-hour emergency departments with more than six beds. In this analysis, the current estimates were compared to the estimates from the previous year (2009), as well as to a base year. The base year chosen for comparison was 2001.<sup>7</sup> The existence of a possible trend in injuries associated with ATVs with three, four, or an unknown number of wheels is also considered, using trend analysis methods developed by CPSC staff (Schroeder, 2000). For historical estimates of the number of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries, see Appendix B.

Table 5
Annual Estimates <sup>8</sup> of ATV-Related, Emergency Department-Treated Injuries
ATVs with 3, 4, or Unknown Number of Wheels
January 1, 2001 through December 31, 2010

Year	Estimated Number of Injuries: All Ages	Estimated Number of Injuries: Ages Younger than 16 years	Percent of Total: Ages Younger than 16 Years
2010	115,000	28,300	25%
2009	131,900	32,400	25%
2008	135,100	37,700	28%
2007	150,900	40,000	27%
2006	146,600	39,300	27%
2005	136,700	40,400	30%
2004	136,100	44,700	33%
2003	125,500	38,600	31%
2002	113,900	37,100	33%
2001	110,100	34,300	31%

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: National Electronic Injury Surveillance System.

Note: The coefficients of variation (CVs) for the all-ages injury estimates range from 9 percent to 11 percent. During this same time period, CVs for injury estimates among the under 16 age group range from 9 percent to 13 percent. See Appendix A for an explanation of the use and calculation of CVs.

The 2010 emergency department-treated injury estimate for all ages reflects a decrease of 12.8 percent over the 2009 estimate. This decrease is statistically significant (p-value = 0.0034)<sup>9</sup>. The overall increase of 4.5 percent between the estimated number of injuries in 2001 and 2010 is not statistically significant (p-value = 0.51). In addition, trend analysis (Schroeder, 2000) indicates that, for ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels, there is a statistically significant upward trend in emergency department-treated injuries for all ages, collectively, during the years 2001 through 2010 (p-value = 0.0332).

The 2010 emergency department-treated injury estimate for children younger than 16 years of age represents a 12.7 percent decrease over the 2009 estimate, although this is not a statistically significant decrease (p-value = 0.0649). The difference in the 2001 and 2010 estimated number of emergency department-treated injuries for children younger than 16 years of age decreased 17.5 percent; however, these estimates are marginally statistically different (p-value = 0.0461). A statistically

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See the methodology section in Appendix A for a discussion of the rationale for choosing 2001 as the base year.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Estimates have been adjusted to reflect NEISS Coding Manual changes and sampling frame updates. Estimates have also been adjusted to account for cases that are out of scope for this report. See Appendix A for additional discussion.
<sup>9</sup> The produce represente the probability of phoenium and the phoeniu

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The p-value represents the probability of observing results as extreme as, or more extreme than, the results obtained if there is no difference in the two reported estimates. A small p-value (*e.g.*, p-value < 0.05) suggests that an observed difference is likely to reflect a difference between the two estimates that is associated with some factor or factors beyond the inherent variability in the estimates themselves. P-values listed in this report have not been corrected for multiple comparisons.

significant trend for children younger than 16 years of age is not detected from 2001 to 2010 (p-value = 0.1924).

When taking into account only children younger than 12 years of age, 12 percent (14,100) of the estimated number of ATV-related, emergency department-treated injuries are represented in 2010. Considering the years 2001 to 2010, children younger than 12 years of age represent 13 percent of estimated emergency department-treated injuries (*i.e.*, 172,700/1,301,800) and 46 percent of the estimated number of emergency department-treated injuries for children younger than 16 (*i.e.*, 172,700/372,800).

Of the 115,000 estimated ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries in 2010 (28,300 for children younger than 16 years of age), a majority are categorized as treated and released (88 percent for all ages and 90 percent for children younger than 16 years of age). Eleven percent of the estimated emergency department-treated injuries for all ages are categorized as either treated and admitted or treated and transferred (9 percent for children younger than 16 years of age). The remaining percentages of treatments are spread across several categories, such as left without being seen, held for observation, fatalities, and unknown.

The plurality of the 2010 estimated ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries for all ages were diagnosed as contusions/abrasions or fractures (25 percent and 24 percent, respectively). The corresponding percentages in 2010 for children younger than 16 years of age were 30 percent for contusions/abrasions and 19 percent for fractures. The remaining diagnoses are distributed into categories, such as lacerations, sprains/strains, internal organ injuries, and concussions.

Table 6 further breaks down the estimated numbers of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries from 2001 to 2010 by age groups, while Figure 3 gives the corresponding graph of Table 6.

Ade	Year									
Group	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010
Under 16	34,300	37,100	38,600	44,700	40,400	39,300	40,000	37,700	32,400	28,300
16–24	34,500	33,300	36,600	36,500	37,400	44,500	45,800	35,000	36,400	29,500
25–34	20,100	19,900	24,300	25,800	27,100	29,300	31,200	30,700	30,200	25,900
35–44	13,500	13,900	15,000	16,100	17,400	16,700	17,800	18,000	16,600	15,200
45–54	3,900	5,900	6,700	7,800	9,600	9,600	9,600	8,000	10,100	9,000
55 +	3,800	3,700	4,300	5,100	4,800	7,200	6,500	5,800	6,200	7,000
Total	110,100	113,800	125,500	136,000	136,700	146,600	150,900	135,200	131,900	114,900

 Table 6

 Annual Estimates of ATV-Related, Emergency Department-Treated Injuries by Age Group

 2001–2010

Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: National Electronic Injury Surveillance System. Note: Columns may not sum to annual totals presented elsewhere due to rounding.

ATVs with 3, 4, or Unknown Number of Wheels (2001 - 2010)50,000 under 16 ----16-24 25-34 35-44 45-54 55+ 40,000 ATV-Related Injury Estimate 30,000 20,000 10,000 0 2001 2005 2002 2003 2004 2006 2007 2008 2009 2010 Source: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: Year National Electronic Injury Surveillance System.

Figure 3 Annual ATV-Related Hospital Emergency Department-Treated Injury Estimates by Age Group

Analysis of information in Table 6 (see page 14) and Figure 3 supports the following:

- The decrease in the estimated numbers of ATV-related emergency department-treated injuries • is statistically significant in the 16- to 24-year-old age group from 2009 to 2010 (p-value = 0.0014).
- The decrease from 2009 to 2010 for the 25- to 34-year-old age group is statistically significant (p-value=0.0459). If this p-value were corrected for multiple comparisons (see footnote 9 on page 13), the decrease from 2009 to 2010 for the 25- to 34-year-old age group would not be statistically significant.
- The increase from 2009 to 2010 in estimated injuries is not statistically significant for the 55+ age group (p-value = 0.29). The decreases from 2009 to 2010 for children under 16 years of age, the 35- to 44- year old age group, and the 45- to 54-year-old age group is not statistically significant (p-value = 0.06, p-value = 0.27, p-value = 0.30, respectively).
- From 2001 to 2010, the estimated number of injuries for the age groups 25 to 34, 45 to 54, and 55+ have a statistically significant increasing trend (p-value = 0.0003, p-value = 0.0012, and pvalue = 0.0181, respectively).

#### Four-Wheel ATVs

Table 7 shows estimates of four-wheel ATV-related injuries and risk of injury per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use for the years 2001 to 2010. In 2010, four-wheel ATV injuries constituted 99.8 percent of the total injury estimate for ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels (*i.e.*, 114,800/115,000). The four-wheel ATV emergency department-treated injury estimate for 2010 represents a 10.75 percent decrease over the 2009 estimate; this decrease is statistically significant (p-value = 0.0105). There is a statistically significant increase over the 2001 estimate (p-value = 0.0247). And there is a statistically significant upward trend in emergency department-treated injuries associated with four-wheel ATVs that occurred between 2001 and 2010 (p-value = 0.0057).

In Table 7, "risk" is defined as the estimated number of emergency department-treated injuries per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use. From 2001 to 2010, there is a statistically significant downward trend in injury risk per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use (p-value < 0.0001).

Table 7
Estimated Number of 4-Wheel ATV-Related Emergency Department-Treated Injuries and
Risk of Emergency Department-Treated Injury per 10,000 4-Wheel ATVs in Use
January 1, 2001 through December 31, 2010

Year	4-Wheel ATV-Related Injury Estimate <sup>10, 11</sup>	Estimated 4-Wheel ATVs in Use (millions)	Risk Estimate per 10,000 4-Wheel ATVs in Use
2010	114,800	10.6	108.0
2009	128,600	10.5	122.9
2008	131,700	10.2	129.7
2007	146,500	9.5	153.9
2006	140,900	8.6	163.0
2005	130,000	7.8	167.2
2004	129,500	7.0	185.4
2003	116,600	6.3	186.3
2002	104,800	5.6	188.5
2001	98,200	4.9	200.3

Sources: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: National Electronic Injury Surveillance System, the Directorate for Economic Analysis, and the Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis.

Note: The coefficients of variation (CVs) for four-wheel ATV injury estimates (column 2) are all about 9 percent. For these same years, the CVs for the estimates of the number of four-wheel ATVs in use (column 3) range from 3 percent to 4 percent, and the CVs for the risk estimates (column 4) range from 9 percent to 10 percent (see Levenson, 2005a, 2005b, and 2005c for discussion of the methods used to estimate these CVs).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Estimates have been adjusted to reflect NEISS Coding Manual changes and sampling frame updates. Estimates have also been adjusted by factors to account for cases that are out of scope for this report. Appendix A provides further detail.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Estimates have been rounded.

## Discussion

In analyzing deaths and injuries associated with ATVs, it is useful to consider three distinct periods, the boundaries of which are determined primarily by fatality data availability and by the completeness of the available data. By considering these three periods separately, we can compare years within periods, and thereby control, at least in part, for changes in fatality data availability, as well as for possible changes in the ATV marketplace. While the boundaries of the periods considered here are defined by factors involving the collection of mortality data, it is also useful to consider the injury estimates within the same periods.

The periods selected for discussion were defined as follows:

- The first period, from 1982 to 1998, begins with the first year of CPSC staff's reported ATVrelated death counts (see Table 1), and it ends with the ICD-9 to ICD-10 transition for classification of mortality data.
- The second period, from 1999 to 2006, begins with the transition to ICD-10 coding, and ends with the most recent complete year of death data collection.
- The third period, from 2007 to 2010, spans the period of ongoing mortality data collection by CPSC staff.

ATV-related deaths and injuries occurring in each of these three periods are reviewed below.

#### <u>1982–1998</u>

In the first period (1982–1998), reported deaths reached a high of 299 in 1986 (Table 1). These reported deaths were largely associated with three-wheel ATVs, which were still being manufactured and sold. During the mid-1980s, three-wheel ATVs were still heavily in use, and four-wheel ATVs were only beginning to gain in popularity.

As previously noted, CPSC staff's ability to gather death reports during the first period (1982–1998) was limited by the ICD-9 reporting codes and by ICD-9 reporting requirements, which made it difficult for CPSC staff to obtain death certificates for ATV-related fatality incidents occurring on public roads (see Appendix A). Consequently, the death estimates for this period are likely to be underestimated. However, because data collection methodologies were substantially consistent throughout the first period, general comparisons among the annual death estimates within the first period may still be made, if the degree of underestimation is similar from year to year. Other than the ICD-9 coding, CPSC staff is not aware of any factors that would have contributed to an underestimation of ATV-related fatalities in this period. CPSC staff is also not aware of any factors that would have caused differences in ICD-9-related underestimation in different years.

With these cautions in mind, a review of Table 4 suggests that, during the first period, the estimated number of deaths associated with all ATVs (*i.e.*, ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels) likely peaked around 1986. This peak was followed by a decline in estimated ATV-related fatalities until the early to mid-1990s (Table 4). Then, a general increase in the estimated deaths appears to have occurred from the mid-1990s to the end of the period (Table 4). As previously mentioned, this reporting period utilized the ICD-9 reporting requirements, and thus the death estimates for this period are likely to be underestimated. The reader should use caution when generalizing in this period due to the impact of this on the magnitude of the estimates. The reader is cautioned against making similar generalizations over this same time period regarding the estimated number of four-wheel ATVs in use and the estimated risk of death per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use because these

latter measures may be subject to sources of variability other than those associated with the death estimates.

A similar pattern can be observed in the estimated number of emergency department-treated injuries associated with ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels (see Appendix B for injury estimates for this period). That is, the estimated number of ATV-related, emergency department-treated injuries appeared to peak during the years 1985 and 1986 (Table 8, page 25), when injuries rose above 100,000. This was followed by a decline in injury estimates until the early- to mid-1990s, and then by an increase in estimated injuries until the end of the period. The similarities between death and injury data suggest that the pattern seen in the estimated number of deaths is not simply an artifact of the fatality data.

### <u>1999–2006</u>

Because of the transition to ICD-10 mortality coding, the second period (1999–2006) reflects several years during which CPSC staff had a greater opportunity to collect comprehensive data on ATV-related fatalities than had been possible prior to 1999. ATV-related regulatory activity began just as this reporting period was ending. Consequently, any effect of heightened media exposure on data collection would be less of a factor in the second period (as compared to the third period, 2007-2010). However, this effect could have been changing in 2005, due to the exposure resulting from the issuance of an advanced notice of proposed rulemaking in 2005, and a notice of proposed rulemaking in 2006, by the CPSC. Comparing the estimated numbers of deaths associated with ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels from 1999 through 2006, there is an increase of 69 percent (Table 4). The estimated numbers of emergency department-treated injuries associated with ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels increased 79 percent from the 1999 estimate of 82,000, to the 2006 estimate of 146,600 (Table 8 in Appendix B, page 25).

### 2007-2010

The third period (2007–2010) contains 4 years of incomplete death data. As of January 31, 2011, death certificate completion was 87 percent for 2007, 77 percent for 2008, and 61 percent for 2009, and 19 percent for 2010. (This is not a percentage of death certificates versus actual deaths, but rather, an indication of months in which death certificates were received from each state.) It is likely that the number of reported deaths for these years will increase as CPSC staff receives additional reports. For this reason, the 2007 through 2009 estimated numbers of deaths and estimated risks of death per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use will likely require revision for these years in future CPSC staff reports.

During the third period, emergency department-treated injury estimates for all ages decreased each year from 2007 through 2010, both for ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels (Table 5), and for four-wheel ATVs alone (Table 7). For ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels, the overall decrease from 2007 to 2010 is statistically significant (p-value < 0.0001). This is also seen when considering the decrease in the estimated number of injuries associated with four-wheel ATVs from 2007 to 2010 (146,500 and 114,800, respectively; p-value = 0.0001). It should be noted that the data collection process supporting the derivation of the injury estimates is complete for all reported years, including this period (2007–2010). Thus, the injury estimates for 2007 through 2010 are not expected to require revision in future CPSC staff reports.

Just prior to this period, the CPSC issued both an advance notice of proposed rulemaking (2005) and a notice of proposed rulemaking (2006) for ATVs. In 2008, the Consumer Product Safety Improvement Act of 2008 (CPSIA) became law. Section 232 of the CPSIA included provisions directing the CPSC to make the voluntary standard, the *American National Standard for Four Wheel All-Terrain Vehicles,* developed by the Specialty Vehicle Institute of America (American National Standard ANSI/SVIA 1 – 2007), a mandatory standard. The mandatory standard was published in late 2008, and became

effective in April 2009. In addition, all companies importing and distributing ATVs in the United States were required by the CPSIA to have action plans approved by, and on file with, the Commission. The CPSIA also banned the importation and distribution of three-wheel ATVs. One likely result of the recent regulatory focus on ATVs may have been an increase in media attention on ATV-related fatalities; and this, in turn, may have resulted in the collection of more complete and timelier death reports during these periods.

Also, just prior to and continuing into this time period, the CPSC launched a campaign to increase awareness of ATV safety via television and radio public service announcements, created <u>www.ATVSafety.gov</u>, and partnered with organizations and officials dedicated to promoting ATV safety. In 2006, the CPSC's website, www.ATVSafety.gov, was launched and includes information on ATV safety, state laws and regulations for ATVs, and fatality and injury data. The CPSC's Office of Information and Public Affairs (OIPA), now the Office of Communications (OCM), initiated a Rapid Response program in April 2007, to respond to ATV-related deaths and injuries. The Rapid Response program is triggered when there is a report of an ATV death or injury. Working with media in the affected area, the CPSC's OCM publishes information on ATV safety by means of radio and television public safety announcements or through news stories. By raising awareness of ATV safety, this campaign was designed to reduce the number of deaths and serious injuries associated with ATVs (U.S. CPSC OIPA, 2006).

## **Appendix A: Estimation Methodologies**

This appendix describes the methodologies used to estimate ATV-related deaths and injuries and other information used in developing the report analyses.

#### ATV-Related Deaths

#### In-Scope ATV-Related Fatalities

ATV-related fatalities considered in scope in this report include any unintentional incident involving an ATV, whether or not the ATV was in operation at the time of the incident. Because of the difficulties inherent in distinguishing between occupational and nonoccupational use, occupational fatalities are included in both the death counts and the death estimates. For example, it may be difficult to classify a fatality that occurs when a victim is riding next to a fence on a ranch to examine the fence, and subsequently is involved in an ATV-related fatality incident while deviating from his work to take a recreational ride up a nearby hill.

#### ICD-9 Versus ICD-10 Coding

In 1999, CPSC staff began collecting death certificates for all fatalities where an external cause of death listed on the death certificate was reported to involve an ATV, as coded under ICD-10. ICD-10 marks the first revision where all ATV-related fatalities are grouped under a single code (V86.X), thereby facilitating more complete collection of these incidents by CPSC staff than accomplished prior to 1999.

It should be noted that the ICD-10 codes (V86.X) characterizing the external cause of death as "ATVrelated," include fatalities resulting from all specialty motor vehicles intended primarily for off-road use (World Health Organization, 2007). Thus, other types of off-road vehicles are captured in this set of codes, such as dune buggies, ROVs, UTVs, and dirt bikes. By conducting in-depth investigations (IDIs), CPSC staff attempts to verify that the vehicles involved in these incidents were ATVs, as defined by CPSC staff (*i.e.*, an ATV is a motorized vehicle intended for off-road use and having three or four low pressure tires, a straddle seat for the operator, and handlebars for steering control). In cases where the specific type of off-road vehicle cannot be ascertained, CPSC staff counts the death report as an ATVrelated fatality. This assumption may result in an overestimation of ATV-related deaths.

#### Estimation of ATV-Related Fatalities (1999–Present)

CPSC staff estimates the number of deaths associated with ATVs by use of a capture-recapture approach. This approach involves examining the numbers of reports of ATV-related fatalities gathered via two different avenues:

- The first avenue is the collection of death certificates obtained by CPSC staff,<sup>12</sup> where the death is deemed by the medical examiner to be ATV-related. These incidents are entered into CPSC staff's death certificate database (DTHS).
- The second avenue involves the collection of reports of fatal ATV-related incidents by any other means available to CPSC staff (denoted non-DTHS). Sources of these types of reports include news clips; reports from the Medical Examiners and Coroners Alert Project (MECAP); reports

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> CPSC staff purchases death certificates from the 50 states, the District of Columbia, and New York City for fatalities involving selected consumer products, including ATVs. Determination of the association between a fatality and a consumer product is based on the external cause of death code(s) reported on the death certificate. Since 1999, the external causes of death reported on U.S. death certificates have been coded in accordance with ICD-10 (National Center for Health Statistics, 2007).

from consumers or their representatives via telephone or the Internet; and hospital reports from the National Electronic Injury Surveillance System (NEISS). As for NEISS reports, it should be noted that the NEISS database primarily includes product-related injuries rather than fatalities. However, all ATV-related NEISS cases are reviewed to identify incidents where an emergency department-treated, ATV-related injury was reported to result in death; and these deaths are included in the ATV-related fatality reports available to CPSC staff.

In many cases, CPSC staff receives fatality reports for the same incident from multiple sources. The reports are either about deaths counted in a previous annual report, or deaths reported for the first time in this annual report. For example, CPSC staff may receive a MECAP report for a fatality that previously was reported to CPSC staff via a news clip. Reports from non-DTHS sources are reviewed carefully to match multiple source reports about the same incident for both the current reporting year and for previous years. Incidents that have been reported in multiple sources are only counted once in Table 1.

The calculation of the capture-recapture estimate entails the matching of fatality reports from DTHS and non-DTHS sources. Then, for each year of interest, CPSC staff determines the total number of fatalities included in DTHS, the total number of fatalities included in non-DTHS sources, and the total number of deaths included in both sources (*i.e.*, DTHS and non-DTHS). Thereafter, the estimate is calculated using the following equation (Hook and Regal, 1992; Morrison and Stone, 2000; Hook and Regal, 2004):

$$estimate = \frac{(M+1)(N+1)}{n+1} - 1$$
 Equation 1

where

*M* is the number of incidents captured by purchase of death certificates from the states (DTHS); *N* is the number of incidents collected by other means (non-DTHS);

and

*n* is the number of incidents captured by both death certificate purchase and at least one other source.

Estimates of fatalities that occurred on or after January 1, 1999, and that are associated with ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels are calculated using equation 1.

Estimation of ATV-Related Fatalities (1985–1998)

Prior to 1999, CPSC staff received death certificates for only two types of ATV-related fatality incidents: (1) ATV-related fatalities occurring in places other than public roads, and (2) ATV-related fatalities occurring on public roads that were erroneously reported as nonpublic roads. Because of this, the capture-recapture procedure for estimating pre-1999 ATV-related deaths had two parts:

- For public road fatalities, the estimates were based solely on the number of fatalities reported to CPSC staff. Reports of these fatalities were largely contained in CPSC staff's Injury or Potential Injury Incident file (IPII). As noted, death certificates generally were not received for these fatalities.
- For incidents occurring in other places, the capture-recapture approach was applied.

Using equation 2, these two parts (*i.e.*, incidents occurring on public roads and incidents occurring in other places) were combined to derive the pre-1999 annual estimates of ATV-related deaths for ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels.

$$estimate = \frac{(M_{NP} + 1)(N_{NP} + 1)}{n_{NP} + 1} - 1 + C_P$$
Equation 2

#### where

- $M_{NP}$  is the number of reports of nonpublic-road fatalities captured by purchase of death certificates from the states;
- $N_{NP}$  is the number of reports of nonpublic-road fatalities collected by other means;
- $n_{NP}$  is the number of reports of nonpublic-road fatalities captured by both death certificate purchase and at least one other source;

#### and

 $C_P$  is the count of reports of ATV-related fatalities occurring on public roads from any source.

CPSC staff believes that the ATV-related fatality estimates for the years prior to 1999 were likely to be underestimated because the pre-1999 estimates used only the available counts of public road fatalities and did not account for missing reports in these types of incidents. As noted previously, CPSC staff now receives death certificates for ATV-related incidents occurring on public roads. Consequently, since 1999, the capture-recapture approach has been applied fully to both components (*i.e.*, those incidents occurring on public roads and those incidents occurring in other locations) of the annual estimates of ATV-related deaths. For this reason, CPSC staff expects that the annual death estimates for 1999 and later represent better estimates of ATV-related fatalities than were possible in the years before 1999.

#### Estimation of Fatalities Associated with Four-Wheel ATVs

A number of incidents reported to CPSC staff involve ATVs for which the number of wheels is unknown. Because some of these likely involve four-wheel ATVs, the unknowns are apportioned in the calculation of the estimated number of deaths associated with four-wheel ATVs. This estimate is calculated by first dividing the reported number of deaths for four-wheel ATVs by the combined reported number of deaths for four-wheel ATVs, and then multiplying this quotient by the estimated number of deaths for all ATVs (three, four, or unknown number of wheels). Thus, the estimate of deaths associated with four-wheel ATVs is given by equation 3.

$$estimate_{4W} = \frac{rep_{4W}}{rep_{3W+4W}} est_{3W+4W+UW}$$
 Equation 3

where

and

 $estimate_{4W}$  is the estimated number of fatalities associated with four-wheel ATVs;  $rep_{4W}$  is the reported number of fatalities associated with four-wheel ATVs;  $rep_{3W+4W}$  is the reported number of fatalities associated with three- and four-wheel ATVs;

 $est_{3W+4W+UW}$  is the estimated number of fatalities associated with ATVs having three, four, or an unknown number of wheels. [Note: this is the "estimate" derived in equations 1 and 2].

#### Risk of Death per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use

The risk of death associated with four-wheel ATVs in use is calculated by dividing the annual estimate of fatalities associated with four-wheel ATVs ( $estimate_{4W}$ ) by the estimated number of four-wheel ATVs in use in a given year. Annual estimates of the numbers of four-wheel ATVs in use are determined from four-wheel ATV sales and operability rates based on CPSC staff studies (Levenson, 2003a; Levenson, 2003b) and on information compiled by the CPSC's Directorate for Economic Analysis. Annual four-wheel ATVs-in-use estimates for 1994 and prior years are computed from a survival model derived from 1994 data. Annual four-wheel ATVs-in-use estimates for years 2001 and after are computed from a survival model derived from a survival model derived from 2001 data. Estimates of the annual numbers of in-use, four-wheel ATVs for the intervening years come from a model that provides a smooth transition between the 1994 and

the 2001 survival models. The estimated numbers of four-wheel ATVs in use in Tables 4 and 6 are rounded figures. As a result, risk estimates calculated using these rounded figures may not match the estimates presented in the tables.

Because reliable operability rate data are not available for three-wheel ATVs, this report presents only the risk of death per 10,000 <u>four-wheel</u> ATVs in use.

#### Estimation of ATV-Related Injuries

All injury estimates in this report have been derived from data collected through the CPSC's National Electronic Injury Surveillance System, a probability sample of U.S. hospitals with 24-hour emergency departments with more than six beds (Schroeder and Ault, 2001a and 2001b). Thus, ATV-related injury estimates in this report represent hospital emergency department-treated injuries only. ATV-related injuries that were not treated in hospital emergency departments are not included in these estimates.

Injury estimates have been adjusted to reflect revisions in the NEISS Coding Manual in 1985, as well as to account for NEISS sampling frame updates (Marker *et. al.*, 1988; Marker and Lo, 1996). Estimates for 1982 through 1985 also were adjusted based on a review of NEISS comments to exclude dune buggies and include ATVs that had been misclassified as mini or trail bikes.

Injury estimates for 1985, 1989, 1997, and 2001 are based on injury surveys using NEISS cases. Injury estimates for 2010 are based on a partial-year study of surveys of NEISS cases. Injury estimates for other years have been adjusted by factors to account for out-of-scope (occupational, intentional, and/or non-ATV) cases based on injury studies in these years (Garland, 2011; Levenson, 2003c; Rodgers and Zamula, 1986; Rodgers, 1990; U.S. CPSC, 1998). An in-scope injury case is defined to be any nonoccupational, unintentional case involving an ATV, whether or not the victim was operating the ATV at the time of the incident. Note that NEISS does not collect occupational injuries; and, thus, the definition of in-scope, ATV-related injuries, differs slightly from the definition of in-scope, ATV-related fatalities. The applied adjustment factors were as follows: 0.93 for 1986 through 1988, 0.95 for 1990 through 1996, 0.903 for 1998 through 2000 (amended from 0.935), 0.922 for 2001 thorough 2009, and 0.899 for 2010.

### Coefficients of Variation

A coefficient of variation (or CV) is an expression of the standard deviation relative to the estimate itself. In this report, CVs for injury estimates are given as percents. The adjustment factors discussed above are also estimated and have associated variability. This variability (along with the variability of the injury estimates) affects significance tests and tests for trends. Calculation of NEISS estimates and their variances is discussed in Schroeder and Ault (2001a) and Schroeder and Ault (2001b). Adjustment factors and other concepts specific to variability associated with ATV estimates are more fully discussed in Levenson (2003c, 2005b, 2005c) and Garland (2011).

### Estimation of Hospital Emergency Department-Treated Injuries Associated with Four-Wheel ATVs

NEISS includes injuries that are associated with ATVs for which the number of wheels is unknown. Because of this, the estimated injuries associated with ATVs having an unknown number of wheels are apportioned in the calculation of the estimated injuries associated with four-wheel ATVs, using equation 4.

$$total estimate_{4W} = \frac{est_{4W}}{est_{3W} + est_{4W}} (est_{3W} + est_{4W} + est_{UW})$$
 Equation 4

where

- *total estimate*<sub>4W</sub> is the total estimated injuries associated with four-wheel ATVs with unknowns apportioned;
- $est_{4W}$  is the injury estimate associated with four-wheel ATVs (excluding unknowns);
- $est_{3W}$  is the injury estimate associated with three-wheel ATVs (excluding unknowns);

and

 $est_{UW}$  is the injury estimate associated with ATVs with an unknown number of wheels.

### Risk of Injury per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use

The risk of injury per 10,000 four-wheel ATVs in use is calculated as the total estimated number of hospital emergency department-treated injuries associated with four-wheel ATVs ( $total estimate_{4W}$ ), divided by the number of four-wheel ATVs in use, and then multiplied by 10,000. Annual ATV population estimates are the same as those used in the calculation of risk of death and are discussed on page 18 in this appendix. Trend analysis of the risk of injury follows the methodology discussed in section 4 of Levenson 2005b.

## Changes in Injury Estimates and Risk of Injury per 10,000 Four-Wheel ATVs in Use

Consistent with the previous ATV Annual Report (U.S. CPSC, December 2010), relative changes in the annual injury estimates shown in Table 5 through Table 7 are assessed using 2001 as the base year (see pages 10–13). There have changes in the ATV market in more recent years (*e.g.*, 2001-2010), including the increase in sales of new-entrant import model ATVs from 2001 through 2007 and the overall decrease in sales between 2008 and 2010.

# Appendix B

Number of Wheels and for 4-wheel ATVs from 1985 to 2010							
Year	Estimated Number of Injuries: All Ages (3, 4, and unknown number of wheels)	Estimated number of Injuries: Under 16 years (3, 4, and unknown number of wheels)	Estimated Number of Injuries: All Ages (4-wheel ATVs)	Estimated 4-Wheel ATVs in Use (millions)	Risk Estimate per 10,000 4-Wheel ATVs in Use (All Ages)		
2010	115,000	28,300	114,800	10.6	108.0		
2009	131,900	32,400	128,600	10.5	122.9		
2008	135,100	37,700	131,700	10.2	129.7		
2007	150,900	40,000	146,500	9.5	153.9		
2006	146,600	39,300	140,900	8.6	163.0		
2005	136,700	40,400	130,000	7.8	167.2		
2004	136,100	44,700	129,500	7.0	185.4		
2003	125,500	38,600	116,600	6.3	186.3		
2002	113,900	37,100	104,800	5.6	188.5		
2001	110,100	34,300	98,200	4.9	200.3		
2000	92,200	32,000	82,300	4.2	197.2		
1999	82,000	27,700	68,900	3.6	193.0		
1998	67,800	25,100	57,100	3.1	184.7		
1997	52,800	20,600	39,700	2.7	146.1		
1996	53,600	20,200	40,700	2.4	168.1		
1995	52,200	19,300	36,200	2.2	165.7		
1994	50,800	21,400	33,300	2.0	165.4		
1993	49,800	17,900	32,000	1.9	164.9		
1992	58,200	22,000	33,000	1.9	175.1		
1991	58,100	22,500	34,400	1.8	188.1		
1990	59,500	22,400	30,800	1.8	175.1		
1989	70,300	25,700	35,700	1.6	217.8		
1988	74,600	28,500	39,400	1.4	276.1		
1987	93,600	38,600	33,900	1.1	305.9		
1986	106,000	47,600	23,400	0.7	319.2		
1985	105,700	42,700	14,700	0.4	391.1		

Table 8Historical ATV-Related Emergency Department Treated Injury Estimates for ATVs with 3, 4, or UnknownNumber of Wheels and for 4-wheel ATVs from 1985 to 2010

Sources: U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission: National Electronic Injury Surveillance System, the Directorate for Economic Analysis and the Directorate for Epidemiology/Division of Hazard Analysis.

### References

Garland, S. (2011) 2010 ATV Injury Adjustment Factor, 2010 Adjustment Factor Standard Error, and 2010 Adjustment Factor Implementation in ATV-related Injury Analyses, memorandum. June 16, 2011. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Hook, E.B. and Regal, R.R. The Value of Capture-Recapture Methods Even for Apparent Exhaustive Surveys. *American Journal of Epidemiology*. 1992; 135(9):1060–1067.

Hook, E.B. and Regal, R.R. Completeness of Reporting: Capture-Recapture Methods in Public Health Surveillance. From: *Monitoring the Health of Populations: Statistical Principles and Methods for Public Health Surveillance*, Brookmeyer, R. and Stroup, D.F., eds. 2004. Oxford University Press, New York.

Levenson, M. (2003a) *All-Terrain Vehicle 2001 Injury and Exposure Studies.* January 2003. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Levenson, M. (2003b) 2001 ATV Operability Rate Analysis, memorandum. May 6, 2003. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Levenson, M. (2003c) ATV Injury Adjustment Factors for 1997 and 2001, memorandum. September 12, 2003. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Levenson, M. (2005a) *Analysis of U.S. ATV Injury Risk Between 1997 and 2001.* August 2005. U. S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Levenson, M. (2005b) Uncertainty Estimates of Annual ATV Risk Estimates, memorandum. August 22, 2005. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Levenson, M. (2005c) Uncertainty Estimates of ATV Adjusted Injury Estimates, memorandum. August 22, 2005. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Marker, D., Waksberg, J., and Braden, J. NEISS Sample Update. June 3, 1988. Westat, Inc.

Marker, D. and Lo, A. *Update of the NEISS Sampling Frame and Sample.* October 11, 1996. Westat, Inc.

Morrison, A. and Stone, D.H. Capture-Recapture: A Useful Methodological Tool for Counting Traffic-Related Injuries? *Injury Prevention*. 2000; 6:299–304.

"About the International Classification of Diseases/Clinical Modification (ICD-10-CM)." National Center for Health Statistics (NCHS). August 2007. <u>http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/icd.htm</u>.

Rodgers, G.B. *Descriptive Results of the 1989 All-Terrain Vehicle Exposure Survey*. September 1990. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Rodgers, G. and Zamula, W. Results of the ATV Exposure Study, memorandum. September 12, 1986. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Schroeder, T. *Trend Analysis of NEISS Data*. February 2000. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Schroeder, T. and Ault, K. (2001a) *The NEISS Sample (Design and Implementation) From 1979 to 1996.* June 2001. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

Schroeder, T. and Ault, K. (2001b) *The NEISS Sample (Design and Implementation) From 1997 to the Present.* June 2001. U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission. *All-Terrain Vehicle Exposure, Injury, Death and Risk Studies.* April 1998.

U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission. *Standards for All Terrain Vehicles and Ban of Three-Wheeled All Terrain Vehicles; Notice of Proposed Rulemaking.* Federal Register, Volume 71, Number 154, Pages 45904–45962. August 10, 2006.

U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission. 2009 Annual Report of ATV Deaths and Injuries. December 2010.

U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission, Office of Information and Public Affairs (OIPA) (September 21, 2006). <u>CPSC Launches Major Campaign to Drive Down Deaths and Serious Injuries</u> <u>Associated with All-Terrain Vehicles</u>. Press Release. Retrieved September 16, 2009.

"International Classification of Diseases." World Health Organization (WHO). Retrieved December 4, 2007 from: <u>http://www.who.int/classifications/icd/en/</u>.